Conference:
Housing – A Critical Perspective
AMPS CONFERENCE 3

Housing – A Critical Perspective

Liverpool: 08—09 April, 2015

SERIES EDITOR:

Dr. Graham Cairns

BOOK EDITOR:

Dr. Graham Cairns

PRODUCTION EDITOR:

Eric An

© AMPS C.I.O.
Housing – A Critical Perspective

INTRODUCTION

This publication is the product of the conference Housing – A Critical Perspective held in Liverpool in 2015. It was organised by AMPS together with the Sociology Department of Liverpool University and the Architecture Department of Liverpool John Moores University. It was a two day interdisciplinary conference on the global theme of affordable housing provision. This publication, and the conference which it documents both form part a broader program of international events, Housing – Critical Futures.

The provision of adequate housing is one of the most important political issues today. Against a background of disparate policy interventions, resistances and conflicting aspirations, the Housing – A Critical Perspective conference sought to bring together disparate voices: architects, planners, developers, sociologists, artists, housing associations, community representatives and policy makers. Reflecting the belief that housing and its social implications are not discipline-specific concerns the conference invited cross-disciplinary and creative thinking from those engaging in research and practice from both inside and outside academia. This publication reflects that perspective perfectly.
Housing – A Critical Perspective

INDEX

1: PARAMETRIC ELEMENTS TO MODULAR SOCIAL HOUSING 8
Miguel P. Amado and Inés Ramalhete
Lusiada University of Lisbon & University Nova of Lisbon
Lisbon University

2: NEW HOUSING MODELS FOR AN AUTARKIC RURAL COMMUNITY 24
Dr. Neil Burford and Carol Robertson
Architecture and Planning, School of the Environment, University of Dundee

3: #SHARE HOME @ LONDON’S HOUSING STRUGGLES 43
Albane, Duvillier
Architectural Association School, London

4: HISTORICAL MILITARY HERITAGE AND SOCIAL HOUSING: A SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITY 56
Donatella Rita Fiorno
University of Cagliari, Dicaar

5: A CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF URBAN REGENERATION PROGRAMMES IN EUROPE 65
Karim Hadjri, et al.
University of Lancaster, et al.

6: DENSITY: A NUMBERS GAME, BUT WHAT’S THE ALTERNATIVE 83
Claire Harper
University of Westminster
7: AGEING POPULATION GROWTH AND CRITICAL HOUSING QUESTIONS IN NEW ZEALAND
Olufunto Ijatuyi; Errol Haarhoff; Alessandro Melis
School of Architecture and Planning, the University of Auckland, New Zealand

8: SYNERGIES OF A SHARED HOUSEHOLD
Eleni Katrini
Carnegie Mellon University, School of Architecture

9: THE LOCAL DIMENSION OF HOUSING EMERGENCIES
Alessandra Lai
University of Sassari, Italy

10: [FAVOURIT HOUSING] HOW TO CREATE NEW ARCHITECTURAL COMMUNION METHODS – CUSTOMIZED FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF FUTURE HOUSING
Moa Liew and Christel Nisbeth
Within Walls

11: THE ROLE OF THE GOVERNMENT IN SUBSIDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING
Emma Lindley
De Montfort University

12: ALTERNATIVE THIRD WAVE HOUSING FUTURES
Dr Rob Macdonald and Bill Halsall
Liverpool John Moores University, and HL Partnership

13: THE ROLE OF SOCIAL MOVEMENTS IN THE CONSTRUCTION OF HOUSING SOLUTIONS IN RIO DE JANEIRO
Marianna Fernandes Moreira and Rafael Gonçalves de Almeida
Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (UFRJ)

14: STUDY ON DOMESTIC OCCUPANT ENERGY CONSUMPTION BEHAVIOR AND INCOME LEVEL IN BEIJING, CHINA
Muzhou Wang and Nianxiong Liu
Tsinghua University
15:  
LONG AFTER THE RING, MASS HOUSING MAY NOT BE APOCALYPtical  
Monica Pacheco  
SCTE-IUL/Dinâmia-CET, Lisbon, Portugal

16:  
THE HOUSE AS HOME: A CROSS-CULTURAL STUDY IN IRAN AND AUSTRALIA OF HOW ADULTS' PERCEPTION OF THEIR HOUSES ARE AFFECTED BY MEMORIES OF THEIR CHILDHOOD HOMES  
Mahnaz Pejam  
Insight Architecting Pty Ltd. (Australia)

17:  
CRITERIA FRAMEWORK FOR THE CONCEPTION OF AN ADAPTIVE HOUSING MODEL FOR SUB-SAHARAN REGION  
Inés Ramalhete; Miguel P. Amado; Hugo Farias  
Faculty of Architecture, Lisbon University; Faculty of Science and Technology of Nova University of Lisbon; Faculty of Architecture of Lusia da University of Lisbon

18:  
UNDERTERMINED SPACES  
Ines Seixas Pinto  
Faculdade de Aquitectura da Universidade Técnica de Lisboa

19:  
SENIOR HOUSING: CRITICAL PERSPECTIVE OF RESIDENTS, DEVELOPER, AND ARCHITECT  
Amanda Smoot, and Dr. Marilyn Bruin  
University of Minnesota

20:  
TRACING RESIDENTIAL PREFERENCES OF SOLO-LIVING. THE FINNISH PERSPECTIVE IN AN INTERNATIONAL CONTEXT  
Virve Väisänen  
Oulu School of Architecture, University of Oulu, Finland

21:  
TERRACED HOUSE TYPOLOGY AS POLIS – SIEDLUNG HALEN AS A LONG-TERM DEVELOPMENT  
Claudia Volberg  
University of Technology Graz
HISTORICAL MILITARY HERITAGE AND SOCIAL HOUSING: A SUSTAINABLE OPPORTUNITY

DONATELLA RITA FIORINO

AUTHOR AFFILIATION
UNIVERSITY OF CAGLIARI, DICAAR

INTRODUCTION

This study aims to prove that the restoration and refurbishment of ancient cultural buildings could represent a key opportunity for Social Housing. It specifically references historic military sites already decommissioned or are likely to be decommissioned in the coming years. During this relatively peaceful period military sites all around the world, especially in Europe¹ and in the USA², are being transferred to civilian use. This means that entire quarters, villages and large architectural complexes are going to be available for new purposes. Military decommissioning is not only an Italian issue so an international debate is required.

Italian military sites are very often located in areas with outstanding landscapes or inside historic centres. The buildings are usually well designed and of safe construction. They are also characterised by a simple style with interesting ornamental features and they are often declared national monuments. Moreover, many of these buildings are modular and some have already been residences of military personnel. For this reason, they are potentially ideal for conversion into housing.

The case study of Sardinian military heritage is relevant to the topic and a strategy a sustainable conversion of these sites is urgent. In order to manage this process a detailed knowledge of the entire heritage is necessary, both in terms of historical and material aspects of the buildings.

The present paper illustrates the commencement of a specific scientific research project dedicated to the investigation into possible adaptive reuse of military sites as housing. This is only one aspect of a wider study dedicated both to the maintenance of military sites still in use and to the reuse of decommissioned areas.

The first part of the research focuses on the inventory of Sardinian military heritage and the definition of a knowledge plan designed to guide the planners in the conversion process. The second part is dedicated to opportunities and general criteria for housing conversion. Finally, the paper references a Sardinian case study. Unfortunately, there are not any examples of this kind of reuse in Sardinia or indeed Italy, so that it is not possible to show a real case history. However, some practical examples are discussed here as a possibility of future projects.

THE KNOWLEDGE PLAN FOR MILITARY HERITAGE REUSE

Italian military heritage offers an interesting variety of architectural typologies such as coastal towers, bastions and fortresses, strongholds, citadels, garrison stations, barracks, former prisons, World War II sites and NATO headquarters (Fig. 1-2).

The island of Sardinia has a strategic location in the Mediterranean which has lead to it being ruled by various foreign powers throughout its history. This has resulted in an extraordinary variety of military architecture³. The earliest types of defensive architecture are those related to the four medieval autonomous kingdoms called ‘Giudicati’ (XI-XIII centuries). In this period, the contemporary alliance of these kingdoms with Pisa and the Republic of Genoa for the defence of the coasts from the Arabs had the direct effect of attracting important merchant families because of the foundation of fortified citadels mainly located on rocky hills. The most important citadel is the one in Cagliari⁴.
From around 1570 several coastal towers were erected at the behest of the Spanish Crown, as part of a defensive plan against the Saracens. The Royal Administration of Towers, established in 1581 by Phillip II of Spain, managed the entire defensive system. This institution continued during the Savoy period (from 1720 to 1861) before being finally abolished in 1842. The new military forces related to the unification of Italy constructed new military stations such as garrisons, prisons, large complexes and entire villages. In addition, during World War II several sites were fortified and at the beginning of the 1950s NATO base camps were installed.

A database system has been prepared to store a census and details of this wide defence heritage. The database considers the following general information: identification, qualification of typology, chronology, historic notes, illustrations and technical information. Current and historical uses are also considered in order to reconstruct the historical military network each asset belongs to; this is particularly relevant for the conservation of the authenticity of the historic military sites. The database also includes the recording of the state of conservation and specialist assessment on historic and artistic values. This is really useful for the definition of possible future redevelopment. Furthermore, each building is required to be analysed in detail by means of a geometric, material and morphological survey. For this reason, the first step of the study is a new architectural survey of each building. It is often the case that sites lack a sufficiently detailed survey. Plans, facades, sections, constructive details are absolute necessities to enable site reuse.

The historical knowledge of the building and the different phases of construction is also essential. Information can be found by the archival investigation and by the analysis of documents related to past worksites. Historical plans and documents can then be compared with the current situation to define the chronology of structures. It is possible to overlap the current survey with several ancient plans belonging to different periods. This is very useful technique for recognising items in the plan evident in the historical and current surveys as well as identifying elements illustrated in the ancient plan that no longer exist. Infrared thermography is a very useful technique to visualise extinct elements which become apparent due to the differences in specific temperature of materials. Infrared thermography is also useful for checking electrical, water and gas services, for identifying constructive elements, for studying heat transmission and the presence of humidity, etc. However, the core of the study is the definition of the different types of constructive elements. The database considers examination of the foundation, masonry, roof, window, paving, plaster and decorations. The examination also foresees the assessment of the fitness for purpose as well as the
evaluation of damages by means of a sequence of codes. This accurate and complete survey is the only method to reveal the possible historical assets that are available for preservation.

With this purpose, a scale of historical and artistic interest has been defined in order to identify the consequent level of possible transformability. This scale includes four degrees of interest, identified by the codes 'Isa', 'Isc', 'Ite', 'Iti'.

Isa has the highest degree and refers to 'historic and artistic interest'. In this case, the item is authentic and has relevance for material, style, technique and aesthetics. As a consequence subjects with this code have the highest priority for preservation.

'Isc' is the code for 'historic and constructive interest'. Sites with this code have original and authentic constructive and structural elements. They represent material evidence of historical construction and of the coeval material culture and are worthy of restoration and preservation. Masonries, walls, roofs and other technical elements very often have a remarkable historical and constructive interest.

The third level is 'Ite'. This refers to the 'testimonial interest' and includes architectural elements or finishing preserved in their material authenticity. They are testimony to material culture so should be preserved through the restoration or through the preservation of the typology where the element is no longer able to fulfil its functions.

The final code is 'Iti' which refers to 'typological interest'. This categorises architectural elements that no longer exist but are recognizable via historical and archival documentation. For example, something rebuilt in the same position and for the same purpose as the previous element. Although, because it has been totally changed, it does not present any direct interest in material and constructive aspects it should be preserved in order to keep memory of the ancient structure.

The database set up for this project also records the state of conservation and includes a vulnerability data sheet with a similar set of codes to the above. The sequence of codes, associated to a single element gives complete information on its condition and effectiveness and qualifies possible degradation. Figure 3 is an example of an analysis of a paving, using the illustrated double code.

Figure 3. The codes for the evaluation of the state of conservation (symbols in square) and the scale for the definition of historical and artistic interest (symbols with circle). Example for paving.

At the end of this complex codification of each constructive elements, the planner can count on a detailed map of ‘restrictions’ and ‘degree of freedom’. Every planned transformation for the adaptive reuse is supposed to be coherent with this fundamental assessment. This means that only incongruous
components of the buildings or items of any interest could be removed or replaced, while every interesting component of the historic building has to be preserved. Following these criteria, the quality of the reuse project can be easily evaluated by checking the correspondences between demolitions and transformation and the just described assessment degree of historical interest.

**OPPORTUNITIES AND CULTURAL CRITERIA FOR HOUSING CONVERSION**

Italian military properties become regional property at the time of disposal and, on request, they can be transferred at a symbolic price to municipalities to be used for public purposes. Nationally, several plans have been presented in recent years concerning the conversation of military heritage into civilian use. These have often been oriented towards student housing. These innovations come from the latest law for Italian economic enhancement, which contains advantageous measures for military decommissioning with social housing aims. This is a unique opportunity for refurbishing abandoned military monuments whilst keeping them in a good state of maintenance and providing much-needed low-cost housing at a time of economic crisis.

For this reason, Turin, Rome, and other municipalities are working hard to achieve this goal, following interesting international examples such as the German cohousing project of Vauban in Friburg.

The main problem is that refurbishment entails providing facilities to improve the quality of the building and to create better living conditions. The transformation could involve environmental, sanitary, functional, structural, and energy supply measures. Every choice requires awareness, effectiveness and consideration to the fact that buildings involved in this process are very often monuments.

What are the criteria for the conversion and reuse?

The Venice Charter for the conservation of cultural heritage (1964) recommended compatible reuse in order to limit demolitions and damage to cultural structures. In fact, in article nr. 4, it declares that *It is essential to the conservation of monuments that they be maintained on a permanent basis*, and moreover, at article n. 5 it states that *The conservation of monuments is always facilitated by making use of them for some socially useful purpose. Such use is therefore desirable but it must not change the lay-out or decoration of the building. It is within these limits only that modifications demanded by a change of function should be envisaged and may be permitted.*

The reuse of ex-military sites for social housing could ensure the maintenance of these historic buildings and, at the same time, ensure that social housing is of the highest quality of historical architecture in terms of values and materials. Undoubtedly, this kind of strategy needs the synergic work of a multidisciplinary team of restorers, architects, historians, designers, economists, and sociologists. However, results have to meet the needs of both politicians and residents.

This theoretical construct of sustainable and integrated conservation comes from the Amsterdam Declaration (1975) and represents our starting point. It states that *Conservation requires a pool of qualified planners, architects, technicians and craftsmen to prepare conservation programmes.* Furthermore, integrated conservation involves the responsibility of local authorities and calls for citizens' participation.

In practice, the main and most important and generally recognized criteria include the following action: to maximize conservation; to remove incongruous elements; to discover solutions that come from the building; to act for addition, never for subtraction; to ensure reversibility and distinctness; to carefully check and manage the worksite; to use consolidated techniques that have already passed the proof of time, to consider and plan future maintenance.

An analysis of the context is also necessary, especially in case of reuse of entire headquarters, where only an accurate master plan could avoid the creation of slums or dormitory quarters.

Turning to technical compatibility of this adapting reuse, the strong point is that military bases and especially barracks offer inner spaces – room’s dimension, staircase features, windows and doors sizes, wall’s thickness, structure’s stability – that easily fulfill the higher standards for a comfortable living. In addition, the general symmetry of plans makes the buildings easy to be divided into different
living units. Furthermore, the repetitiveness of the project in the entire national territory\(^\text{11}\) stimulates the outline of a general programme of conversion.

**SARDINIAN CASE STUDY**

What kind of Sardinian military architecture can been considered for residential purpose?

Among the typologies above mentioned, the ones, which can be considered most compatible with a residential use, are barracks, built by the end of the nineteen century and in the beginning of the twentieth century, but also the big complexes related to Italian Army or NATO base camps.

An interesting case study is that of the Carabinieri station barracks. The Corps of the Royal Carabinieri was instituted in Turin by the by Royal Warrant of the King of Sardinia, Vittorio Emanuele I, on 13th July 1814. This military Corp had the dual function of first-line national defence and policing using special powers and prerogatives. The Force was given a territorial task and was organized into divisions, one for each province. The divisions were called Companies and they were subdivided into Lieutenancies which commanded and coordinated the local police stations, and were distributed throughout the national territory to maintain direct contact with the public\(^\text{12}\).

Carabinieri barracks were designed to house the Marshal (the head of the station), his family and the military stationed in the municipality. They consist of small buildings that are usually located in the historic centres of small municipalities, close to the Town Hall and the church to form a sort of institutional square.

These buildings are usually characterized by great stability and simple decorations. Typically, they have a modular plan which was designed by the central government and repeated all over Italy. Constructive features, such as the thickness of the walls and strong building materials, ensure excellent performance levels. The only adjustments that may be required are windows and main services such as electricity, plumbing, air-conditioning, etc.

---

*Figure 4. Carabinieri barracks in Sardinia (CA): the case of Ballao (abandoned), Villasalto (used for social activities) and Narcao (still military)*

Several barracks are now owned by Municipalities. Many of these are still abandoned and only a few have been restored and reused. Their reuse has mainly been oriented to public, representative and cultural functions such as town halls, museums, charitable and voluntary association premises and schools. Very often reuse has caused heavy transformations such as consolidations, demolitions and enlargements works.

The best restoration work is that of Villasalto (CA) station, carried out in 2007, where the original building has been converted into a public library and offices for volunteers. This restoration work has maintained structures, shape and dimensions of rooms, original staircases, roofs and decorations. It has not been possible to find a Sardinian example of barrack already converted into social housing. This fact seems to be strange, if we consider the above mentioned modularity of this buildings and their historical residential use. The only examples are the projects for the Carabinieri station of Dolianova and Guasila, but they haven't been carried out.

In the last thirty the municipality of Dolianova, a small village near to Cagliari, has developed significant social intervention which includes social housing plans. The project for the conversion of
the barracks into housing was called 'The Social Courtyard' due to the traditional type of residences widespread in Italy. This ex-military complex is composed by two main buildings of two floors each, some ground floor rooms and two courtyards. The reuse of this architecture as housing seems possible with minimal transformation, following the criteria of conservative restoration. The only new works are in regard to energy efficiency, bio architecture and environmental sustainability. The buildings are particularly adaptable to small residences for young couples, elderly persons, small families in economic difficulties. The historic city centre location is particularly convenient for community services. This project dates back to 2010 and can be considered a good starting point for Sardinian housing in terms of aims and criteria, but it is affected by several technical and cultural problems to be solved, mainly related to a very lacking preliminary knowledge plan and to the inadequate assessment of cultural values.

Turning to future researches, it seems interesting the case study of the old garrison and Carabinieri station of Macomer (NU), also used as school in the Fifteens. It is located in the historic centre of a small town in the north of Sardinia and it consists in two main buildings of two floors, resting on an area of around 255mq. The urban plan for the historic centre allows in this area the project of public services and indicates for the building a conservative restoration, with a low degree of possible transformability. The architectural complex, probably build in XVI century and later transformed, is currently abandoned. The plans of the two floors are regular and easy to be divided into six small residential units, restoring traditional techniques (Figures 6 - 7). The illustrated preliminary study is the first step of the investigation protocol for the definition of its sustainable reuse that is still in progress.
CONCLUSION

Historical military heritage represents a tangible and remarkable opportunity for housing. However, the conversion has to balance the needs of social requirements and fundraising programmes. Initially, a deep knowledge of this heritage is essential, together with the analysis of risks connected to reuse. For this reason effective transformations can only be the result of a multidisciplinary working group composed of architects, town planners, historians, scientists, economists, sociologists and anthropologists, coordinated by the institutions involved and politicians. A preliminary analysis of the context is also necessary, especially in cases where entire headquarters are reused. Only an accurate master plan can evaluate possible equilibrium between public and private use and to avoid the creation of slums or dormitory quarters that are deficient in terms of services and social exchange.
The aim of this cooperation should be the definition of possible scenarios, in order to discover and understand advantages and disadvantages of each transformation and define concrete reasons for investment by public and private institutions.

ENDNOTES

1 Paola Pellegrini and Christina Conti, ‘La valorizzazione delle caserme dismesse, un metodo per affrontare la restituzione all’uso’, TECHNE no. 3 (2012): 224-237.
6 Donatella Rita Fiorino, ‘Chapitre II. Conservation et entretien, in AA.VV., in Manuel Technique des interventions pour les jouissement des sites fortifiés (Genova: Sagep 2013), 32-53.
7 The complex protocol of investigation has been developed during the research programme financed by the Sardinia Regional Government (P.O.R. Sardegna F.S.E. Operational Programme of the Autonomous Region of Sardinia, European Social Fund 2007-2013 - Axis IV Human Resources, Objective I.3, Line of Activity I.3.1 "Avviso di chiamata per il finanziamento di Assegni di Ricerca"). The illustrated codification was successfully tested on the Cagnabona military base (Cagliari) during a specific research study on chronological evolution of the architectural complex and the preliminary assessment of single constructive elements for the definition of the restoration project. General research coordinator for the knowledge plan: D.R. Fiorino; commissioner: Italian Ministry for Infrastructures and Transportation – Agency for Public Works.
11 A specific document entitled ‘Determinazioni’ (Disposals) indicated the main features of the military buildings planned for hosting a Carabinieri station. They can be consulted at <www.carabinieri.it>.
13 A first study of the old garrison in Macomer (NU) has been carried out by the Eng. Francesca Meloni with the supervisor of the lecturer Donatella Rita Fiorino Fiorino, during the academic course of Restoration at the University of Cagliari (2014/2015).

BIBLIOGRAPHY


INTERNET LINKS

- http://www.ance.it/docs/docDownload.aspx?id=23587
- http://www.abitarearoma.net/caserma-ruffo-tiburtina-cosa-ce-dentro/#.VfwUbPntlBc
- http://www.abitarearoma.net/ridiamo-vita-popolo-caserma-ruffo/#.VfwVkPntlBc
- http://www.difesa.it/BeniImmobili/Pagine/BeneImmobile100.aspx